

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN JOSE DIVISION**

JONATHAN LALO, individually and On Be-  
half of a Class of Similarly Situated Individu-  
als,

Plaintiff,

v.

APPLE INC, a California Corporation;  
BACKFLIP, a Delaware Corporation;  
DICTIONARY.COM, a California  
Corporation; PANDORA, INC., a California  
Corporation; THE WEATHER CHANNEL, a  
Georgia Corporation,

Defendants.

Case No. CV-10-5878 LHK (PSG)

**STIPULATION AND ORDER CONSOLI-  
DATING CASES; AND ADOPTING  
PRELIMINARY CASE SCHEDULE,  
EXCEPT AS MODIFIED BY THE  
COURT HEREIN**

DUSTIN FREEMAN, JARED PARSLEY,  
COLE PARR, and PRECIOUS ARRING-  
TON, on behalf of themselves and all similar-  
ly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

APPLE, INC., a Delaware Corporation; GO-  
GII, INC., a Delaware Corporation; PANDO-  
RA MEDIA, INC., a California Corporation;

Case No. CV-10-5881 LHK (PSG)

1 BACKFLIP STUDIOS, INC., a Delaware  
 2 Corporation; THE WEATHER CHANNEL,  
 3 INC., a Georgia Corporation; DICTIO-  
 4 NARY.COM, LLC., a California Corporation;  
 5 OUTFIT7 LTD, a Foreign Corporation;  
 6 ROOM CANDY, INC., a California Corpora-  
 tion; SUNSTORM INTERACTIVE, Inc., an  
 Indiana Corporation,  
 Defendants.

7 ANTHONY CHIU, individually and on behalf  
 8 of all others similarly situated,  
 9 Plaintiff,  
 10 v.  
 11 APPLE, INC., a California Corporation, and  
 12 DOES 1 to 50 inclusive,  
 Defendants.

Case No. CV-11-0407 LHK

13 DANIEL RODIMER, et al.  
 14 Plaintiffs

Case No. CV-11-0700 PSG

15 v.  
 16 APPLE, INC., FLURRY, INC., MEDIALETS,  
 17 INC., PINCH MEDIA, INC., QUATTRO  
 18 WIRELESS, INC., IAC/INTERACTIVE  
 19 CORP., DICTIONARY.COM, PANDORA,  
 20 INC., and THE WEATHER CHANNEL  
 Defendants.

21  
22 **STIPULATION AND ORDER**

23 Subject to the Court’s review and approval, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND  
24 AGREED AND ORDERED as follows:

25 WHEREAS, the related actions *Lalo, et al. v. Apple Inc., et al.*, CV-10-5878-LHK;  
26 *Freeman, et al. v. Apple Inc., et al.*, CV-10-5881-LHK, *Chiu v. Apple, Inc., et al.*, CV-11-0407-  
27 LHK and *Rodimer v. Apple, Inc., et al.*, CV 11-0700 PSG (collectively, the “Actions”) are  
28 pending before this Court; and,

1 WHEREAS, counsel for the various plaintiffs have each concluded that it is in the best  
2 interests of the respective parties and absent putative class members that the above-captioned  
3 actions be consolidated for all purposes and proceed as contemplated herein; and,

4 WHEREAS, all parties that have appeared, through their respective counsel have stipu-  
5 lated to the terms provided herein;

6 WHEREAS, it is anticipated that additional related actions may be transferred to, re-  
7 moved to, or filed in this Court; and,

8 WHEREAS, the existence of common questions of law and fact in the Actions now  
9 pending before this Court, the interests of fair and efficient administration of the Actions, the  
10 avoidance of unnecessary duplicative efforts and the avoidance of inconsistency in outcomes,  
11 warrants the consolidation of the Actions, establishment of an organizational structure for  
12 plaintiffs' counsel, and the setting of a status conference to discuss, among other things, sche-  
13 dules for the filing of pleadings, motion practice and discovery, and good cause appearing  
14 therefore:

15 **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED AS FOLLOWS:**

16 **I. CONSOLIDATION AND TREATMENT OF SUBSEQUENT ACTIONS**

17 1. The Court finds that *Lalo, et al. v. Apple Inc., et al.*, CV-10-5878-LHK; *Free-*  
18 *man, et al. v. Apple Inc., et al.*, CV-10-5881-LHK, *Chiu v. Apple, Inc.*, CV-11-0407-LHK and  
19 *Rodimer, et al. v. Apple, Inc., et al.* CV-11-0700-PSG present substantially similar issues of law  
20 and fact, have been previously related, and are hereby consolidated into *Lalo, et al. v. Apple*  
21 *Inc., et al.*, CV-10-5878, and are referred to herein as the Consolidated Action. Each document  
22 filed by a party to this litigation shall bear the following caption:

23 \_\_\_\_\_  
24 In re iPhone Application Litigation No. CV-10-5878 LHK (PSG)  
25 \_\_\_\_\_

26 2. The terms of this Order shall apply to the Consolidated Action and to any and all  
27 actions later instituted in, removed to, or transferred to this Court that involve the same or sub-  
28 stantially similar issues of law and fact, subject to the following procedures:

1 a. When such a case is filed in, removed to, or transferred to this Court, **and only**  
2 **after counsel call to the attention of the Court and the Clerk the filing or transfer of any**  
3 **such case that might be properly consolidated with this Consolidated Action**, the Clerk of  
4 Court shall:

- 5 (1) place a copy of this Order in the separate file for such action; and
- 6 (2) make an appropriate entry on the docket for the Consolidated Action.

7 b. Each new case that arises out of the subject matter of the Consolidated Action  
8 which is filed in this Court or transferred to this Court, shall be consolidated with the  
9 Consolidated Action and this Order shall apply thereto, unless a party in such newly-  
10 filed or transferred action objects to consolidation, as provided for herein, or any provi-  
11 sion of this order, within ten (10) days after the date upon which a copy of this Order is  
12 served on counsel for such party, by filing an application for relief and this Court deems  
13 it appropriate to grant such application.

14 3. Counsel shall call to the attention of the Court and the Clerk the filing or trans-  
15 fer of any case that might properly be consolidated with the Consolidated Action. Mailing or  
16 other delivery of a copy of this Order by Defendants' counsel or Plaintiffs' Interim Class Coun-  
17 sel (see II. Below), as appropriate, to the counsel in any newly filed or transferred actions shall  
18 constitute valid notice thereof for purposes of establishing its applicability to such action in ac-  
19 cordance herewith.

## 20 **II. ORGANIZATION OF PLAINTIFFS' COUNSEL**

21 1. Plaintiffs shall use their best efforts to self-organize and recommend to the  
22 Court counsel to serve as Interim Class Counsel under FRCP 23(g). Such recommendation  
23 shall be submitted to the Court with papers supporting the qualifications for such Interim Class  
24 Counsel within ten days of the entry of this Order. Any Plaintiff may oppose such recommen-  
25 dation by filing an opposition within 10 days of notice of consolidation of their case or the fil-  
26 ing of said recommendation, whichever is later.

27 2. Interim Class Counsel, acting on behalf of Plaintiffs, shall have the following  
28 duties:

- 1 a. To coordinate all proceedings, including preparing, structuring, and pre-  
2 senting pretrial and other management related orders;
- 3 b. To encourage full cooperation and efficiency among all counsel;
- 4 c. To create any necessary committees and appoint committee chairs and  
5 otherwise delegate responsibilities for specific tasks in a manner to as-  
6 sure that pretrial and trial preparation is conducted effectively, efficient-  
7 ly, and economically;
- 8 d. To delegate work responsibilities and monitor the activities of counsel to  
9 assure that schedules are met and unnecessary expenditures of time and  
10 expense are avoided;
- 11 e. To act as spokespersons at all court conferences;
- 12 f. To call meetings of themselves and/or other counsel as appropriate or  
13 necessary from time to time;
- 14 g. To initiate and conduct settlement negotiations with counsel for the vari-  
15 ous Defendants;
- 16 h. To determine Plaintiffs' position on all matters arising during this litiga-  
17 tion (after such consultation with other counsel as they deem appropri-  
18 ate) and present such position orally and/or in writing to the Court and  
19 opposing parties;
- 20 i. To consult with and employ experts, as necessary;
- 21 j. To initiate, coordinate and conduct discovery;
- 22 k. To represent Plaintiffs at trial and on any appeal of this matter;
- 23 l. To negotiate and execute agreements with local counsel or other coope-  
24 rating attorneys;
- 25 m. To determine the appropriate fee allocation among Plaintiffs' counsel as  
26 they contributed to resolution or otherwise provided benefit to the class;  
27 and  
28

1 n. To perform such other duties as are necessary in connection with the  
2 prosecution of this litigation.

3 3. Interim Class Counsel shall be the contact between Plaintiffs' counsel  
4 and Defendant's counsel as well as the spokesperson for Plaintiffs' counsel. All agreements  
5 reached with the Interim Class Counsel shall be binding on all other Plaintiffs' counsel in the  
6 Consolidated Action.

7 4. Interim Class Counsel are hereby designated as the counsel for Plaintiffs  
8 in the Consolidated Action upon whom all notices, orders, pleadings, motions, discovery, and  
9 memoranda relating to the Consolidated Action shall be served, and Defendants shall effect  
10 service of papers on Plaintiffs in the Consolidated Action by serving Interim Class Counsel.

11 5. No motion or request for discovery shall be served or filed by Plaintiffs,  
12 or other pretrial proceedings initiated by Plaintiffs, except by or with the authorization of Inte-  
13 rim Class Counsel.

14 6. The organizational structure set forth in this section applies to all Plain-  
15 tiffs' counsel in the Consolidated Action, including any action subsequently governed by this  
16 Order.

17 7. No communications among Plaintiffs' counsel shall be taken as a waiver  
18 of any privilege or protection to which they would otherwise be entitled.

19 **III. FILING OF PLEADINGS**

20 Within **21 days** of appointment by the Court, Interim Class Counsel shall file an  
21 amended consolidated pleading. Defendants' shall move or respond to the consolidated com-  
22 plaint within **30 days** thereafter. If defendants shall move to dismiss, Interim Class Counsel  
23 shall have **21 days** to respond and Defendants shall have **14 days** thereafter to file a reply. De-  
24 fendants shall have no obligation to respond to any prior filed pleading in the actions consoli-  
25 dated herein. No other deadlines shall be superseded this Order, unless ordered by the Court.

26 **IV. STATUS CONFERENCE**

27 The Case Management Conference previously set by Court for April 6, 2011 shall re-  
28 main on calendar as a status conference, and not the Initial Case Management Conference con-

1 templated by Civil Local Rule 16-2. In advance of the April 6 status conference, the parties  
2 will meet and confer concerning a schedule for the Initial Case Management Conference and  
3 related matters and will either present a proposed schedule to the Court or present their respec-  
4 tive positions for resolution by the Court at the April 6 status conference. **However, the par-**  
5 **ties must still file a single joint Case Management Statement by March 30, 2011, present-**  
6 **ing their proposed schedule (or respective positions) to the Court.**

7 **V. MODIFICATION OF THIS ORDER**

8 This Order may be modified, supplemented, or superseded by order of the Court, or,  
9 upon the Court's approval, by any party for good cause shown.

10 Dated: March 3, 2011

KAMBERLAW, LLP

11  
12 By: s/Avi Kreitenberg

13 Avi Kreitenberg

14 One of the Attorneys for Plaintiff Lalo,  
15 Individually, and on Behalf of a Class of  
Similarly Situated Individuals

16 SCOTT A. KAMBER (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
17 DAVID A. STAMPLEY (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
18 *skamber@kamberedelson.com*  
19 *dstampley@kamberedelson.com*  
20 KAMBERLAW, LLC  
100 Wall Street, 23rd Floor  
New York, New York 10005  
Telephone: (212) 920-3072  
Facsimile: (212) 202-6364

21 AVI KREITENBERG  
22 KAMBERLAW, LLP  
1180 South Beverly Drive, Suite 601  
23 Los Angeles, CA 90035  
24 Telephone: 1.310.400.1052  
25 Facsimile: 1.310.400.1056

26  
27  
28 PARISI & HAVENS LLP

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Dated: March 3, 2011

By: s/David C. Parisi

DAVID C. PARISI

One of the Attorneys for Plaintiff Freeman,  
Individually and on Behalf of a Class of  
Similarly Situated Individuals

DAVID C. PARISI  
dcparsi@parisihavens.com  
PARISI & HAVENS LLP  
15233 Valleyheart Drive  
Sherman Oaks, CA 91403  
Telephone (818) 990-1299  
Facsimile (818) 501-7852

JEREMY R. WILSON  
[jeremy@wtfirm.com](mailto:jeremy@wtfirm.com)  
WILSON TROSCLAIR & LOVINS  
302 N. Market St., Suite 501  
Dallas, Texas 75202  
Telephone: (214) 430-1930

NABIL MAJED NACHAWATI, II  
[mn@fnlawfirm.com](mailto:mn@fnlawfirm.com)  
FEARS NACHAWATI  
4925 Greenville Avenue, Suite 715  
Dallas, Texas 75206  
Telephone: (214) 890-0711  
Facsimile: (214) 890-0712

MILBERG LLP

Dated: March 7, 2011

By: s/Jeff S. Westerman

Jeff S. Westerman

One of the Attorneys for Plaintiff Chiu,  
Individually, and on Behalf of a Class of  
Similarly Situated Individuals

JEFF S. WESTERMAN  
SABRINA S. KIM  
[jwesterman@milberg.com](mailto:jwesterman@milberg.com)  
[skim@milberg.com](mailto:skim@milberg.com)  
MILBERG LLP  
One California Plaza  
300 South Grand Avenue, Ste 3900  
Los Angeles, California 90071  
Telephone: (213) 617-1200  
Facsimilie: (213) 617-1975

AUDET & PARTNERS LLP



1  
2 Dated: March 4, 2011

By: s/William M. Audet  
William M. Audet  
One of the Attorneys for Plaintiff Rodimer,  
Individually, and on Behalf of a Class of  
Similarly Situated Individuals

3  
4  
5  
6 WILLIAM M. AUDET  
JONAS P. MANN  
7 MICHAEL A. MCSHANE  
waudet@audetlaw.com  
8 jmann@audetlaw.com  
mmcshane@audetlaw.com  
9 AUDET & PARTNERS LLP  
221 Main Street, Suite 1460  
10 San Francisco, California 94105  
Telephone: (415) 568-2555  
11 Facsimile: (415) 568-2556

12 JOSEPH H. MALLEY  
[malleylaw@gmail.com](mailto:malleylaw@gmail.com)  
13 LAW OFFICE OF JOSEPH H. MALLEY  
1045 North Zang Blvd.  
14 Dallas, Texas 75208  
Telephone: (214) 943-6100

15  
16 RICHARD A. LOCKERIDGE  
ROBERT K. SHELQUIST  
*rlockridge@locklaw.com*  
17 *rshelquist@locklaw.com*  
Lockridge Grindal Nauen P.L.L.P.  
18 100 Washington Ave., S., Suite 2200  
Minneapolis, MN 55401  
19 Telephone (612) 339-6900  
20 Facsimile (612) 339-0981

21 ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFFS  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27

28 HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP

1  
2 Dated: March 4, 2011

By: s/Michael L. Charlson

3 Michael L. Charlson

4 On Behalf of Defendant Apple, Inc.

MICHAEL L. CHARLSON (Cal. Bar No. 122125)

5 HOGAN & HARTSON

6 Michael.charlson@hoganlovells.com

7 525 University Avenue, 4<sup>th</sup> Fl

8 Palo Alto, CA 94301

Telephone: (650) 463-4000

Facsimile: (650) 463-4199

9 CHRISTOPHER WOLF (Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)

10 HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP

11 Columbia Square

555 Thirteenth Street, NW

12 Washington, DC 20004

Telephone: (202) 637-5600

13 CLAYTON C. JAMES (Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)

14 HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP

15 One Tabor Center

1200 Seventeenth Street

16 Denver, CO 80204

Telephone: (303) 899-7300

17 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT APPLE, INC.

18  
19 COOLEY LLP

20  
21 Dated: March 7, 2011

By: s/Michael G. Rhodes

22 Michael G. Rhodes

23 On Behalf of Defendants Backflip Studios, The  
Weather Chanel, and Medialets

24 MICHAEL G. RHODES

[rhodesmg@cooley.com](mailto:rhodesmg@cooley.com)

25 MICHAEL D. BROWN

[mbrown@cooley.com](mailto:mbrown@cooley.com)

26 COOLEY LLP

101 California Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Fl

27 San Francisco, CA 94111

Telephone: (415) 693-2000

28 Facsimile: (415) 693-2222

1 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANTS BACKFLIP STUDIOS,  
2 THE WEATHER CHANNEL, AND MEDIALETS

3  
4 DURIE TANGRI LLP

5  
6 Dated: March 4, 2011

By: s/Michael H. Page  
Michael H. Page

7  
8 On Behalf of Defendant Pandora, Inc.,  
IAC/Interactive Corp., Dictionary.com, LLC and  
9 Yelp

10 MICHAEL H. PAGE  
11 JOSEPH C. GRATZ  
mpage@durietangri.com  
jgratz@durietangri.com  
12 DURIE TANGRI LLP  
217 Leidesdorff Street  
13 San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 362-6666  
14 Facsimile: (415) 236-6300

15 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT PANDORA, INC.,  
16 IAC/INTERACTIVE CORP., DICTIONARY.COM, LLC AND YELP

17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27 SHEPPARD MULLIN RICHTER &  
28 HAMPTON LLP

1  
2 Dated: March 8, 2011

By: s/Sacha Von Mende Henry  
Sascha Von Mende Henry

On behalf of Defendant Gogii, Inc.

3  
4 SASCHA VON MENDE HENRY  
5 JONATHAN D. MOSS  
6 [shenry@sheppardmullin.com](mailto:shenry@sheppardmullin.com)  
7 [jmoss@sheppardmullin.com](mailto:jmoss@sheppardmullin.com)  
8 SHEPPARD MULLIN RICHTER & HAMPTON LLP  
9 333 South Home Street, 43d Fl  
Los Angeles, CA 90071-1422  
Telephone: (213) 620-1780  
Facsimile: (213) 620-1398

10 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT GOGII, INC.

11  
12 FENWICK & WEST LLP

13  
14 Dated: March 9, 2011

By: s/Laurence F. Pulgram  
Laurence F. Pulgram

On Behalf of Defendant Groupon, Inc.

15  
16 LAURENCE F. PULGRAM  
17 [lpulgram@fenwick.com](mailto:lpulgram@fenwick.com)  
18 FENWICK & WEST LLP  
19 555 California Street, 12<sup>th</sup> Fl  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Telephone: (415) 875-2390  
20 Facsimile: (415) 281-1350

21 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT GROUPON, INC.

22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27 SHERMAN & STERLING LLP  
28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Dated: March 9, 2011

By: s/James Donato  
James Donato  
On Behalf of Defendant Webmd Health Services  
Group, Inc

JAMES DONATO  
jdonato@sherman.com  
SHERMAN & STERLING LLP  
515 Market Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
Telephone: (415) 616-1143  
Facsimile: (415) 616-1343

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT WEBMD HEALTH  
SERVICES GROUP, INC.

**PURSUANT TO THE STIPULATION AS MODIFIED, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

Dated: March 15, 2011

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
LUCY H. KOH  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE